INTRASPECIFIC VARIATION IN THE INTERNAL TRANSCRIPTION SPACER (ITS) REGION OF GREEN PEACH APHID MYZUS PERSICAЕ [(SULZER) (HEMIPTERA: APHIDIDAE)] UNDER ELEVATED ATMOSPHERIC CO2 PRESSURE

KARACAOĞLU, M.

Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture, Malatya Turgut Ozal University, Battalgazi/Malatya, Turkey
e-mail: mehmet.karacaoglu@ozal.edu.tr

(Received 9th Feb 2021; accepted 16th Apr 2021)

Abstract. The continuously increasing concentrations of atmospheric CO2 is predicted to affect biological processes at many levels of organisms. Yet, no study exists in the literature attempting to describe the elevated atmospheric CO2 (eCO2) concentration may cause an evolutionary response on nucleotide sequences of ribosomal DNA of Myzus persicae [(Sulzer) (Hemiptera: Aphididae)]. Here, we provide a preliminary study to understand how the insect ribosomal DNA sequences are influenced under the elevated CO2 levels after several generations. Four M. persicae populations were established for 35 days under ambient CO2 (a CO2) (400 ppm), e CO2 (600 ppm), e CO2 (800 ppm) and e CO2 (1000 ppm) at 29°C in moisture-controlled greenhouse chambers. Intraspecific variation of M. persicae was assessed by the sequencing and analyzing the internal transcribed spacer (ITS) region of Myzus persicae (Sulzer) under elevated atmospheric CO2 pressure. Based on our results, the phylogenetic analysis of ITS sequences differentiated the individuals grown at 800 ppm CO2 level. The alignment of ITS sequences of all specimens revealed several single-nucleotide substitutions on the nucleotide sequence of M. persicae samples grown at 800 ppm CO2 level. Overall results show that the elevated atmospheric CO2 levels could be a powerful evolutionary force than expected on M. persicae reared on eggplants.

Keywords: evolution, atmospheric CO2, alignment, intraspecific variation, nucleotide comparison

Introduction

Species of the Aphididae (Hemiptera) family species are found almost everywhere in the world, but these pests are more common in temperate regions than in the tropics. It has been reported that there are approximately 5000 species belonging to the Aphididae family in the world and 1600 species in Europe (Nieto Nafria et al., 2013; Blackman and Eastop, 2020). Considering aphids in Turkey, the number of species identified is reported to be 558 (Akyürek et al., 2019; Özdemir, 2020). Aphids are among the most significant pests in agricultural areas around the world. Myzus persicae Sulz. (Hemiptera: Aphididae) causes serious damage both in cover crop and the open field (Blackman and Eastop, 2006; Van Emden and Harrington, 2017). Aphids are generally considered polyphagous pests. Among them M. persicae feed on phloem tissue of plants (Pollard, 1973). As a result of feeding, the growth of the plant may stunt, produce plant galls, cause deformation of leaves, buds, and flowers and transmit plant virus diseases. M. persicae produces large amounts of a sugary liquid waste called "honeydew", and as a result of this secreted substance, saprophyte fungi can grow on honeydew that accumulate on leaves resulting in a decrease in the plant’s photosynthesis (Lodos, 1982). This pest completes its life cycle in a short time when there are suitable climate conditions and continues its life throughout the season. Temperature and humidity play an important role in its development.
M. persicae alone is reported to carry more than 150 plant virus diseases from different crops, including vegetables belonging to the Solanaceae family (Sharma et al., 2008).

Atmospheric CO₂ has increased from about 280 ppm to 400 ppm since the Industrial Revolution in the mid-1700s (Bonan and Doney, 2018). In the inter-country climate panel held in 2014, it was reported that the atmospheric CO₂ rate will increase between approximately 750 and 1300 ppm by the year 2100 (IPCC, 2014). The increase in the CO₂ ratio in the atmosphere in the next century will cause a decrease in the nutrient content in the host of many insect species, thus, it is expected that both larval development time and mortality rate will increase (Carlos and Trumble, 1998). Whether these changes will affect insects' feeding behavior, biology, host preferences, adaptation to climatic conditions and genetics is not clearly known. In the context of climate change, the impact of increased CO₂ on insect species has become a major issue over the last three decades. Elevated CO₂ levels may modify the insect behavior for feeding, but precise effects on insect genetics are poorly known. There have been many studies on the effects of enhanced CO₂ on behavior of insect species (Stiling et al., 2002; Chen et al., 2007; Sudderth and Sudderth, 2014) however, there has been no investigation of the effects of elevated CO₂ levels on intraspecific variation. The purpose of the study was to obtain some initial data regarding the possible effects of ambient and elevated CO₂ levels on intraspecific variation on one example of a species (Myzus persicae) using the internal transcribed spacers of the ribosomal DNA (ITS rDNA) region.

Materials and Methods

Source of green peach aphid and eggplants

The colonies of green peach aphids trapped in the eggplant fields. Once aphids were identified, they were maintained in the temperature controlled growing chamber on the same species (Solanum melongena L. cv. Pala-49) at 14 h day length alternating at temperature of regimes (29/19±1°C) under constant relative humidity (60±10% RH with 14:10 h L:D photoperiod at 8-10 klux light intensity photoperiod conditions). The aphids were sourced from the colony cultured on these plants. The eggplants (Solanum melongena L. cv. Pala-49) were then transferred to a temperature, humidity and CO₂-controlled greenhouse at the Malatya Turgut Ozal University to provide plants for the experiments. A separate concentration of carbon dioxide level was applied in each compartment of the greenhouse including ambient (400 ppm) and elevated 600 ppm, 800 ppm, and 1000 ppm CO₂ levels, consisting of four compartments.

Extraction of genomic DNA from the green peach aphid

Genomic DNA of single aphid was simply and effectively extracted at room temperature using DNeasy® Blood & Tissue Kit (Qiagen, Germany). Seventeen specimens of M. persicae were collected from eggplants grown at ambient (400 ppm) and elevated (600, 800, 1000 ppm) CO₂ levels. The four samples of M. persicae from ambient CO₂ level (400 ppm) were served as controls (Table 1). In order to eliminate the external microbial contaminants, the aphid samples were rinsed in 70% ethanol for 5 min and then rinsed four times with sterilized water to eliminate the external microbial contaminants. The whole body of an adult aphid was used to purify total genomic DNA (Table 1). All DNA preparations were stored at -20°C until use.
Table 1. Characteristics of aphid samples used in this study grown under ambient and elevated CO$_2$ levels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of rooms</th>
<th>CO$_2$ level</th>
<th>Number of individuals produced</th>
<th>Number of samples sequenced</th>
<th>Number of generations</th>
<th>Temperature of each room</th>
<th>After the third generation duration of rearing (day)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1$^{st}$ room</td>
<td>400 ppm</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>29/19*</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2$^{nd}$ room</td>
<td>600 ppm</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>29/19</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3$^{rd}$ room</td>
<td>800 ppm</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>29/19</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4$^{th}$ room</td>
<td>1000 ppm</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>29/19</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*At 14 h day length at temperature of 29 /19°C (L:D) photoperiod at 8-10 klux light intensity

Elevated CO$_2$ conditions and experimental design

Five adult aphids maintained in the growing chamber were removed from their host plant and placed on young eggplant leaves grown at ambient (400 ppm) and elevated 600 ppm, 800 ppm and 1000 ppm levels of CO$_2$ in the green house. The trials were carried out at four-room temperature, humidity and CO$_2$ controlled greenhouse facility located at Malatya Turgut Ozal University. Each had alternating (29/19±1°C) temperature regimes under constant relative humidity and photoperiod conditions (60±10% RH with 14:10 h L:D photoperiod) at 8-10 klux light intensity. M. persicae stock culture was established on the eggplant plant in each CO$_2$ level room. Four young eggplant plants were placed in each room and five M. persicae individuals were transferred on each plant. The aphid samples were taken from the individuals grown in each room, after 4 generations. Individuals taken from each climate room were stored in sample bags at -80°C, and total DNA isolation was made from these samples. Genomic DNA isolation was performed from a single individual.

PCR amplification of 16S rRNA and sequencing

An approximately 730 bp DNA fragment of ITS region of nuclear ribosomal RNA (nrRNA) gene containing ITS1, 5.8S and ITS2 was amplified by polymerase chain reaction (PCR) with the primers (ITS4:5' -TCCTCCGCTTATGATATGC-3'and ITS5: 5'-GGAAGTAAAAGTCGTAACAAGG-3') (White et al., 1990) (Figure 1). The PCR mixture consisted of 5 μL of 10× reaction buffer (200 mM Tris–HCl pH: 8.4, 500 mM KCl), 2 μL of genomic DNA, 1 μL of dNTPs (10 mM each), 3 μL of MgCl$_2$ (25 mM), 1 μL of each primer (100 pmol), 0.4 μL of DNA polymerase, and 36.6 μL of DNase free sterile water. PCR amplification was performed using the following thermocycling program: a 2 min initial denaturation at 94°C, followed by 36 cycles of 94°C for 1 min, annealing at 55°C for 1 min and an extension of 72°C for 2 min, and a final extension of 72°C for 10 min. The PCR amplified DNA fragments were separated on 2% agarose gel containing fluorescent dye and recovered by agarose gel extraction kit (Bioline, Germany). A total of 17 nuclear ribosomal DNA fragments of M. persicae samples, originated from the same population and reared at four levels of CO$_2$, were sequenced after completing their 4$^{th}$ generations in growing chamber. All the sequences studied in this study are deposited in GenBank database under the accession numbers given in Table 2.
Karacaoğlu: Intraspecific variation in the internal transcribed spacer (ITS) region of green peach aphid *Myzus persicae* (Sulzer) (Hemiptera: Aphididae) under elevated atmospheric CO\textsubscript{2} pressure

- 2568 -

Figure 1. Diagram of nuclear ribosomal RNA (nrRNA) gene containing ITS1, 5.8S, and ITS2 regions with primer binding sites

Table 2. List of ITS sequences of *Myzus persicae* samples used in this study, length and GenBank accession numbers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species</th>
<th>CO\textsubscript{2} level (ppm)</th>
<th>Name of the sample</th>
<th>Length (bp)</th>
<th>Accession no</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>Myzus persicae</em></td>
<td>400</td>
<td>Sample 1</td>
<td>698</td>
<td>MW581037</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>400</td>
<td>Sample 2</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581033</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>400</td>
<td>Sample 3</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581028</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>400</td>
<td>Sample 4</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581038</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>600</td>
<td>Sample 1</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581034</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>600</td>
<td>Sample 2</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581035</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>600</td>
<td>Sample 3</td>
<td>698</td>
<td>MW581032</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>600</td>
<td>Sample 4</td>
<td>698</td>
<td>MW581029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>600</td>
<td>Sample 5</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>800</td>
<td>Sample 1</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581036</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>800</td>
<td>Sample 2</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>800</td>
<td>Sample 3</td>
<td>698</td>
<td>MW581039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>800</td>
<td>Sample 4</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>Sample 1</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581070</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>Sample 2</td>
<td>698</td>
<td>MW581071</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>Sample 3</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581072</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>M. persicae</em></td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>Sample 4</td>
<td>699</td>
<td>MW581069</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Bioinformatic analysis**

The ITS sequences of aphid samples were initially edited manually than aligned using CLC Main Workbench Version 6.2 (CLC bio, Denmark) software. To determine the intraspecific variation among the seventeen *M. persicae* samples grown in four different levels of CO\textsubscript{2}, we constructed a phylogenetic tree using ITS sequences obtained in this study. Intraspecific pairwise alignments of all loci considered (ITS1, 5.8S, ITS2) in this research were generated using CLC Main Workbench Version 6.2 (CLC bio, Denmark) software for all *M. persicae* samples. The phylogenetic tree was built under the neighbor joining algorithm. The relationships were assessed using 1000 bootstrap replicates.

**Secondary structure analyses**

In order to predict the most stable secondary structure of the nuclear ribosomal DNA, containing ITS1, 5.8S and ITS2 sequences, the established full sequences were folded...
Karacaoğlu: Intraspecific variation in the internal transcribed spacer (ITS) region of green peach aphid *Myzus persicae* ([Sulzer] (Hemiptera: Aphididae)) under elevated atmospheric CO\(_2\) pressure

and visualized using the mfold structure prediction package of CLC RNA Workbench Version 6.2 (CLC bio, Denmark) software by energy minimizing. Each consensus sequence, belonging to a particular CO\(_2\) level, was folded separately to build the full structure.

**In silico virtual RFLP analysis**

Delimitation of the start and end points of each sequence was carefully trimmed manually in order to arrange the nucleotide bases at the start and end of the sequences were identical for all individuals. Computer-simulated (in silico) RFLP analysis of the ITS sequences of all amplified specimens was performed using pDRAW32 (AcaClone Software). The following 17 restriction enzymes which are commonly used in bench digests and identification in silico RFLP analysis for phytoplasmas (Lee et al., 1998; Oksal et al., 2017; Usta et al., 2018) were adapted and screened: *Alu*I, *Bam*HI, *Bfa*I, *Bst*UI (*Tha*I), *Dra*I, *Eco*RI, *Hae*III, *Hha*I, *Hpa*I, *Hpa*I, *Kpn*I, *Sau*3AI (*Mbo*I), *Mse*I, *Rsa*I, *Ssp*I, and *Taq*I. Among these enzymes, *Hae*III, *Hpa*II and *Taq*I did not cut any of the sequences submitted to digestion, but were retained in the data set for comparison. Following the in silico restriction digestion, a virtual 1.0% agarose gel image plotted automatically to the computer screen to capture the RFLP pattern of 16Sr DNA sequences using the program pDRAW32 (AcaClone Software).

**Results**

An approximately 700 bp single amplified PCR product was obtained in all *M. persicae* samples for the complete rDNA ITS region. The ITS sequence ranged from 698 bp to 699 bp in all accessions. Only three base difference was detected within the 800 ppm CO\(_2\) level of growing condition of *M. persicae*. The divergence in the ITS genes among the individuals grown at 800 ppm tested was low (c. 0.4% informative sites) (Figure 2). However, the variation among the individuals within the individual grown at ambient CO\(_2\) (400 ppm and elevated CO\(_2\) levels (600 and 1000 ppm), appears to be very low, with no informative positions. GenBank accession numbers of the ITS sequences and the origin of samples are given in Table 2.

**Figure 2.** Sequence alignment of ITS region of *M. persicae* individuals grown at different CO\(_2\) levels. Mutational sites of ITS region of *M. persicae* grown at 800 ppm CO\(_2\) level are boxed.
The intraspecific variation among the individuals of *M. persicae* resolved by ITS sequence comparisons. Our results show that the intraspecific variability on ITS sequence of *M. persicae* was noticeable at 800 ppm level. In comparison to ambient CO$_2$, 600 ppm and 1000 ppm CO$_2$ levels, except one specimen, the ITS sequences of a *M. persica* specimens grown at 800 ppm CO$_2$ level was phylogenetically diverse. The green peach aphids grown at 800 ppm are clustered in the same branch (Group I) which clearly distinguished from the other individuals grown under ambient CO$_2$ and 600 and 1000 ppm CO$_2$ levels (Figure 3).

**Figure 3.** Phylogram generated from ITS nucleotide sequence data of 17 *Myzus persicae* specimens grown at elevated CO$_2$ (600, 800 and 1000ppm) levels and ambient CO$_2$ level using the Neighbor Joining algorithm. The value of 1000 was used for bootstrap analysis and corresponding values are shown on individual branches. The green peach aphids grown at 800 ppm CO$_2$ level are boxed.

In *Figure 3*, the neighbor joining phylogram displays the genetic relationships between the aphid samples grown at different CO$_2$ levels. The Group I composed of 2 subgroups. One of the subgroups consists of 3 green peach aphids all from the same chamber of greenhouse having 800 ppm CO$_2$ level, indicating their genetic similarity. This cluster received 78% support in the bootstrap analysis. The Group I consist also individuals from ambient and other elevated CO$_2$ levels, as do Group II, reflecting intraspecific species similarities. However, an aphid sample from the same origin grown at 600 ppm CO$_2$ level (sample 5) did not grouped together by other aphid samples but instead formed a separate individual branch rooting the tree, indicating its divers feature (*Figure 3*). In Group II, the entire ITS sequence was typically fully conserved within the species, and the variation observed was negligible. In general, no distinct treatment effects were observed on ITS sequences in elevated CO$_2$ levels among the aphid samples of Group II. Overall results show that the green peach aphid reared on eggplants at different levels of increased atmospheric CO$_2$ showed a low level of intraspecific variation for Group II members.

Along with nucleotide sequences, the most stabile secondary structure of these sequences was also obtained to compare the topology of sequence paring. What is most significant is the strong distinction in the secondary structure pattern of consensus sequence of individuals grown at 800 ppm CO$_2$ level (*Figure 4*). The most stable secondary structure alone provided a clear and informative secondary structure topology.

The *in silico* RFLP analyses revealed that the ITS region produced similar banding patterns for all seventeen specimens of *M. persicae*. None of the restriction enzyme used in this study were able to generate different banding patterns (*Figure 5*). The banding patterns obtained from restriction digestion was not sufficient to differentiate the tested specimens with no informative positions.
Karacaoğlu: Intraspecific variation in the internal transcribed spacer (ITS) region of green peach aphid *Myzus persicae* (Sulzer) (Hemiptera: Aphididae) under elevated atmospheric CO$_2$ pressure

**Figure 4.** The most stable secondary structure based on 730 bp of consensus ITS sequence of green peach aphids grown at ambient CO$_2$ (A) and elevated (600, 800 (B) and 1000 ppm) CO$_2$ levels

**Figure 5.** *In silico* virtual restriction endonuclease digestion profile of ITS sequence of *M. persicae* grown at 400 ppm CO$_2$ level. In the simulated digestions for the recognition sites 17 restriction enzymes were used. The restriction patterns of the all samples were identical. MW: 1 kb DNA ladder

**Discussion**

The present study was undertaken to investigate the level of intraspecific variation within the rRNA gene sequences of *M. persicae* based on sequence alignment, secondary structure prediction and *in silico* PCR-RFLP under the CO$_2$ pressure. It is frequently reported that the internal transcribed spacer (ITS) region of nuclear ribosomal DNA (nr DNA) has been widely used for identification and phylogenetic analysis of many microorganism, plant and insect families (Lee et al., 1998; Mir et al., 2009; Keskin et al., 2017; Oksal et al., 2017; Usta et al., 2018).

For comparative purposes, we focused on the prediction of the most stable secondary structure of ITS sequences and *in silico* virtual RFLP analysis to our consensus sequences of aphids grown at 400, 600, 800 and 1000 ppm CO$_2$ levels. Point mutations (insertions, deletions or nucleotide substitutions) in ITS sequence of individuals grown at 800 ppm result in a change in secondary structure configuration and fragment size. However, this change did not affect the *in silico* virtual RFLP profiles of aphids tested in this study. The all ITS sequences used in our study showed identical virtual RFLP patterns indicating
that all these samples cannot be distinguished by this method. The present data suggest that the in silico virtual RFLP patterns is not sufficient to understand the intraspecific variation within the species and cannot be perceived by a consideration of virtual RFLP pattern alone. For instance, in this study, the in silico approach implementing virtual digestion by 17 key restriction enzymes, did not enabled easy visualization of polymorphisms in ITS sequences of *M. persicae*. However, it may have done for phytoplasma detection and identification and would ultimately facilitate the discovery of new phytoplasma lineages (Lee et al., 1998; Ramdeen and Rampersad, 2012). In species identification and differentiation, recent entomological applications of RFLP studies have focused on mtCOI gene to solve known mitochondrial DNA polymorphism in Coleoptera, Hemiptera, Hymenoptera, and Lepidoptera (Germain et al., 2013; Arimoto and Iwaizumi, 2014; Ovalle et al., 2014; Vesterlund et al., 2014). Comparison of virtual RFLP analysis versus the prediction of secondary structure analysis revealed that the interpretive feature of the later one seems to be higher in understanding of the intraspecific sequence divergence of a given species.

Mutational variation within ITS sequences of *M. persicae* specimens grown at 800 ppm CO₂ level probably due to the rate of sexual and asexual reproduction, the number of generations annually, the rate of mutation, and the environmental conditions. Covilla and Trumble (1998) emphasize that the extended period of elevated CO₂ level seems to be a strong evolutionary force in many insect species, who has relatively short generation times and potential for rapid genetic turnover.

The ITS region of nuclear ribosomal is separated into ITS 1 and ITS 2. The ITS 1 is present between 18S and 5.8S rRNA whereas ITS 2 is present between 5.8 and 26s rRNA. 5.8S rRNA is a highly-conserved region (Baldwin et al., 1995). Generally, the *M. persicae* individual grown in ambient and elevated CO₂ levels separated into two groups by phylogenetic analysis of ITS sequences. Except one specimen of 800 ppm CO₂, the aphid samples grown at 800 ppm CO₂ level were clustered in the same group. This is more likely to be related to an elevated CO₂ factor, since some characters are strongly affected by different selection pressures (Mir et al., 2010) and, at some level, expected due to the variable nature of the ITS1 and ITS2 sequences (Nilsson et al., 2009). Here, we used elevated CO₂ concentration as selection pressure, however, the data presented above leave little room for interpretation on the actual influence of elevated CO₂ on ITS sequences, thus the reason that mutational changes increased elevated CO₂ level in this study remain unknown. The present results should be tested with more specimens experimentally. Pillmann et al. (1997) reports that for the measurement of the amount of intraspecific variation within a particular population may not require sampling of many individuals. In the point of view of the conserved nucleotide sequences, long term studies will make critical contribution to our understanding of elevated CO₂ effects on sequence divergence within a species.

**Conclusion**

Although there are many studies investigating the possible implications of the increasing CO₂ level in the Earth’s atmosphere on the genetic characteristics of living organisms, the evolutionary affects remains uncertain. We conducted a preliminary study to analyze the possible changes on the green peach aphid ribosomal DNA sequences grown under ambient CO₂ (a CO₂) (400 ppm), e CO₂ (600 ppm), e CO₂ (800 ppm) and CO₂ (1000 ppm) CO₂ levels. Among the green peach aphid individuals who gave several
generations after adapting to different CO$_2$ levels (400 ppm, 600 ppm, 800 ppm and 1000 ppm), striking and exciting differences were found in the ITS region of those who developed at 800 ppm carbon dioxide level. Under the light of these results, it has been seen that elevated atmospheric CO$_2$ levels may have an evolutionary force on $M$. persicae. However, additional studies are needed to test this hypothesis with more aphid samples and high number of offspring. Continued scientific studies are required to determine the relationship between elevated CO$_2$ levels and the evolutionary link.

REFERENCES


